UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

BRETT CHRISTIAN, FIREARMS POLICY COALITION, INC., and SECOND AMENDMENT FOUNDATION

Plaintiffs,

v.

STEVEN A. NIGRELLI, in his official capacity as Superintendent of the New York State Police, and JOHN J. FLYNN, in his official capacity as District Attorney for the County of Erie,

No. 22-cv-00695 (JLS)

Defendants.

SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF RYAN L. BELKA

RYAN L. BELKA, declares under penalty of perjury that the following is true and correct:

- 1. I am an Assistant Attorney General, of counsel to Letitia James, New York State Attorney General, and with my co-counsel James Thompson, I represent Defendant Steven A. Nigrelli, in his official capacity as Superintendent of the New York State Police ("Superintendent Nigrelli"), in this action.
- 2. I make this supplemental declaration in support of Defendant's Supplemental Briefing in Support of Defendant's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for a Preliminary Injunction.
- 3. Attached as **Exhibit A** is a true and accurate copy of excepts from Plaintiff's deposition testimony taken under oath on November 16, 2022.

Dated: Buffalo, New York December 2, 2022

> /s/ Ryan L. Belka RYAN L. BELKA

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

BRETT CHRISTIAN, FIREARMS POLICY COALITION, INC., and SECOND AMENDMENT FOUNDATION

Plaintiffs,

v.

No. 22-cv-00695 (JLS)

STEVEN A. NIGRELLI, in his official capacity as Superintendent of the New York State Police, and JOHN J. FLYNN, in his official capacity as District Attorney for the County of Erie,

Defendants.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on December 2, 2022, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the District Court using its CM/ECF system.

Dated: Buffalo, New York December 2, 2022 LETITIA JAMES

Attorney General of the State of New York

Attorneys for Defendant Nigrelli

BY:

s/Ryan L. Belka

RYAN L. BELKA

JAMES M. THOMPSON

Assistant Attorney General,

of Counsel

Main Place Tower, Suite 300A

350 Main Street

Buffalo, New York 14202

(716) 853-8440

Ryan.Belka@ag.ny.gov



1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
3	
4	BRETT CHRISTIAN, FIREARMS POLICY COALITION, INC., and SECOND AMENDMENT FOUNDATION,
5	Plaintiffs,
6	-vs- Civil Action No. 22-cv-00695 (JLS)
7	
8	STEVEN A. NIGRELLI, in his official capacity as Superintendent of the New York State Police,
9	and JOHN J. FLYNN, in his official capacity as District Attorney for the County of Erie,
10	Defendants.
11	Examination Before Trial of BRETT
12	CHRISTIAN, held before Brooklyn Morton, Notary
13	Public, at Phillips Lytle, LLP, One Canalside,
14	125 Main Street, Buffalo, New York, on November
15	16th, 2022, commencing at 1:00 p.m. and ending
16	at 5:00 p.m., pursuant to notice.
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	APPEARANCES
2	APPEARING FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:
3	PHILLIPS LYTLE, LLP BY: SAM WILLIAMS, ESQ.
4	
5	
6	
7	PHILLIPS LYTLE, LLP
8	
9	
10	
11	APPEARING FOR THE DEFENDANTS:
12	STATE OF NEW YORK OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL
13	
14	ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL Main Place Tower
15	350 Main Street Buffalo, New York 14202
16	(716) 853-8400
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
2324	
2425	
∠ ⊃	

1	WITNESSES						
2	W	ITNESS	EXAMINATION	PAGE			
3							
4	В	BRETT CHRISTIAN					
5			BY MR. BELKA	5, 131			
6			BY MR. ROTSKO	122			
7							
8							
9			EXHIBITS				
10	E	XHIBIT	DESCRIPTION	PAGE			
11	1	NFTA subw	ay ticket	48			
12	2	Declarati	on	117			
13	3	New York license a	State concealed carry pplication	119			
14	4	List of f		120			
15							
16							
17							
18							
19							
20							
21							
2223							
23							
25							
۷ ک							
	D]	EPAOLO CRO	SBY REPORTING SERVICES	S, INC. ———			

- Q. Do you have any reason to believe that your membership lapsed with regard to the Second Amendment between the years 2013 and August 2022?
- A. I don't believe so.
- Q. In your mind if there is a lapse in membership in either of these two organizations, it was due to ineffective mail carrying?
- A. Correct.
 - Q. What is your reasoning to believe that there's a possibility of ineffective mail carrying between the years 2013 and August 2022?
- A. I have lived at different addresses throughout the time.
- Q. That's it?
- 16 A. Yes.

- Q. Okay. As it relates to the sections of the CCIA that you have challenged related to private property, have you been arrested under that provision?
- A. As of currently today, I have not been arrested.
- Q. Have you been approached by law enforcement to arrest you for violations of the CCIA regarding the sections on private property?

A. As of today, I have not.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

21

22

23

24

- Q. Have you been arrested related to the sections relating to New York State Parks that you have challenged under the CCIA?
- A. As of today, I have not.
- Q. Have you been approached by law enforcement to enforce the New York State Parks provisions of the CCIA?
- A. As of today, I have not.
 - Q. Have you been arrested related to the public transportation sections of the CCIA that you have challenged in this lawsuit?
- A. As of today, I have not.
 - Q. And have you been approached by law enforcement regarding the public transportation sections of the CCIA that you have challenged in this lawsuit?
- A. As of today, I have not.
- Q. When you say "as of today," you mean from the beginning of the world until today, correct?
 - A. That's correct. I do not have a crystal ball.

 I don't know what tomorrow may bring and I do

 not wish to guess at the future.
 - Q. All right. Do you recall the testimony about reviewing the words in your declaration that

- granted not a lot of people know it still exists, going from the suburbs to downtown, being able to carry my firearm with me legally. I no longer can do that based upon what's written in black and white in the New York State Penal Code.
- Q. How would you travel from the suburbs downtown using public transportation?
- A. It would primarily be one of the first three stations. There's either University Station, there is LaSalle and then Amherst Street Station. And then driving, parking somewhere nearby, walking in, paying the 4 or 5 bucks for a round trip ticket and then riding it all the way down to it ends right at Canalside at the arena.
- Q. What kind of car do you own?
- 18 A. Currently, I own a 2023 Honda HR-V.
 - Q. Is that your daily form of transport?
 - A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

- Q. And you can drive your 2023 Honda HR-V downtown if you choose, correct?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Do you own any other cars?
- 25 A. No, I do not.

- Q. Okay. And the 2014 Buick Regal GS, was that your daily transport at that time?
- 3 A. Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

15

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. And could the 2014 Buick Regal GS drive downtown?
- A. Yes.
 - Q. Okay. When you had the 2017 Buick LaCrosse, was that your daily transport?
 - A. That would be correct.
- Q. And could the 2017 Buick LaCrosse travel downtown?
- 12 A. That would be correct.
- Q. Okay. And when you had the 2020 Honda Accord, was that your daily transport?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. And could the 2020 Honda Accord travel downtown?
 - A. Mechanically, yes. However, the theft of the wheels that come equipped on the model I had is -- the rate of theft is obscene to the wheels and that car I tended to not want to drive as much downtown because based upon experiences at my job, that there would be a great likelihood I would find it up on blocks as we have had many occurrences at work.

-BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 -

Q. Where is your job?

1

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. Currently, it is at Ray Laks Honda in Orchard Park. 3
 - Q. How do you spell Ray Laks?
 - A. R-A-Y, space, L-A-K-S.
 - Q. And were the tires -- strike that.

What part of the 2020 Honda Accord was often stolen pursuant to anecdotes from your work?

- A. In the last year we have had almost \$40,000 of damage done to vehicles because the model I had, the sport model that had 19-inch very attractive low profile sporty wheels, it is among the most stolen wheels in the country. In one year it was almost \$40,000 of wheels going missing due to theft.
- Q. And did you ever have the wheels on your 2020 Honda Accord stolen?
 - A. I did not because I would be very cautious about where I took the car and where I would park the car because of that reason.
 - Q. Regardless, the 2020 Honda Accord could get you downtown if you so chose?
- A. Mechanically it could, yes.
- You mentioned that there are three locations

-BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 that the discussion about the ticket is 1 2 accurate. MR. BELKA: I accept. 3 Thanks for 4 creating an accommodation because it's unusual. 5 MR. ROTSKO: I can't figure out how to 6 get that up on WebEx. 7 BY MR. BELKA: 8 9 Q. An NFTA Light Rail ticket has been placed in 10 front of you. It's Exhibit 1 to your 11 deposition. Do you see it? A. I do. 12 13 Q. What's the date on that Light Rail ticket? 14 A. It was this past Sunday, the 13th. 15 Q. You are downtown today. You didn't take the 16 Light Rail; is that right? 17 A. Correct. Q. Okay. What car did you drive to get downtown 18 19 today? 20 A. My 2023 Honda HR-V. 21 Q. Do you have a gun on you? 22 A. I do not. 23 Q. Why not? 24 The CCIA prevents me from doing so. Α. 25 Q. Is that because Phillips Lytle prevented you

- from bringing a concealed weapon onto their property?
- A. I was unable to bring one with me on person because I have never been in this building before and I don't know what signs are posted on the property. And if I brought it with me, I would have already entered the property before I would see the signs and, thus, I would have broken the law. So without having that definitive knowledge of it as explicitly stated on a sign that it is allowed, I chose to leave it at home.
- Q. These are your lawyers. You could have called ahead and asked what their concealed carry policy is, correct?
- A. Correct.
- Q. Do you own a phone?
- 18 A. I do.

- Q. Do you know how to use it?
- 20 A. Yes.
 - Q. Do you think you could have used your phone to acquire that information from your lawyers?
 - A. I am unsure because I don't know who the property owner is and the way that it reads, I would have to first figure out who the

-BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 -

property owner is. And with the timeframe of I did not know weeks or months in advance of the exact location, I wasn't able to in time determine that.

- Q. When did you first learn about this deposition?
- A. I learned that it may be a thing that would need to happen roughly, approximately a couple weeks ago. However, the exact date, time, this is the address at this time, be here, that was -- the address was provided this morning to me. The time was provided to me on Monday.
- Q. Have you ever called your lawyers -- this has nothing to do with attorney-client.

Have you ever called your lawyers to ask them a question?

A. Yes.

- Q. Do you feel like you need permission to call your lawyers?
- 21 A. No, I do not.
 - Q. Could you have called your lawyers and asked the policy about concealed carry in the building you would have been entering today?
 - A. Yes. That could have been a possibility.

- Q. And do you think your lawyers would have told you the correct information as to their policy on concealed carry today?
- A. Yes. I believe they would have.
- Q. As it relates to public transportation, you note that you take the NFTA Metro Rail, which I have referred to as the NFTA Light Rail, when traffic or events downtown made driving impractical. Do you recall that testimony?
- A. Yes, I do.

- Q. In your mind, when does traffic make driving downtown impractical?
- A. Monday through Friday and when major events like Sabres games, Taste of Buffalo and events such as those are going on, traffic is quite heavy at those times.
- Q. How do you know traffic is heavy on Monday through Friday during Sabres games?
- A. I have previously been to Sabres games.

 Either work -- the company that I work for has provided tickets for events as well as through the week I have made trips down here to go to either the Erie County Clerks's Office for adding an amendment or removing an amendment to my permit or to stop in to ask

clarification about questions I have to make sure I am doing things the proper way.

But between the 190 and the 33, it is -the 33 in the morning you want to get here
before 6:00 a.m. because it gets very accident
prone and then throughout the day by noon,
1 o'clock, it starts to pick up quite a bit
into the evening. Not discounting Buffalo, of
course, weather events we may have.

- Q. Prior to August 2022, how often would you ride the Buffalo Light Rail?
- A. Approximately two to three times a month, if not more.
- Q. Is the Buffalo Light Rail the only form of -- strike that.

Is the Buffalo Light Rail the only form of public transportation that you regularly take?

- A. That would be correct.
- Q. Is it fair to say -- I am looking at Exhibit 1 now. November 13th, 2022 was the last time you used the Buffalo Light Rail?
- A. Correct.

Q. What event made it impractical to go downtown using your car on November 13th, 2022?

- A. A combination of even with a Honda the price of gas as well as the convenience from University Station to Canalside, the last exit, is almost precisely 20 minutes. It's faster to do that than it is to drive, find a parking spot, pay for parking if it's through the week. Weekends sometimes things are free. It's simply a matter of this is faster and easier. I don't have to worry and deal with the hassle of it.
- Q. Your affidavit -- strike that.

Your declaration says that you take the Buffalo Light Rail when traffic or events downtown make driving impractical, correct?

A. Correct.

- Q. When you took the Buffalo Light Rail on November 13th, was that due to traffic or events downtown?
- A. That was due to --

MR. ROTSKO: Objection. Asked and answered.

- Q. You still have to answer.
- A. An event in Orchard Park, not downtown.

 Everybody is on the thruway and the 33 headed to the Bills game around that time.

-BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 -

Q. And why do you feel -- strike that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Why did you feel it necessary to cancel your trip to the Adirondack Park because of the CCIA?
- A. To get to the Adirondacks it's approximately 5 hours and 15 minutes of travel time, 6 hours and 15 minutes of travel time if you don't go the thruway. Sometimes the side roads are nice, slower pace, less traffic. So with the way the CCIA is, the way it is written in black and white which is what I believe to be the law, if I was to go on the trip, bring with me my pistol and I am carrying it because it is easier to keep it in a holster on your person, less likelihood of getting it stolen because you left it somewhere, I would have to know in advance every restaurant that I may decide to get food at or every gas station. And then if I ended up instead of bringing a sleeping bag and sleeping in the car as I sometimes do, if I went the route of this time I will get a hotel, knowing all the property owner's policies ahead to be compliant and legal, it -- too daunting, if you will.
- Q. Your declaration to me implies that you

- thought that the CCIA applied to the

 Adirondack Park. Was that your understanding

 at the time you signed your declaration?
- A. When I signed it at the time, that was my full belief. However, New York State political leaders have said now that it doesn't apply, but I don't see anything in writing. So I am unsure of New York State Government's stance in that regard.
- Q. You understand it has been represented in this lawsuit that the CCIA does not apply to Adirondack Park, right?
- A. That's what I have heard. However, when I go to the Penal Code and I look it up, I haven't seen the legislature make any changes, make any addendums, amendments, corrections in that regard. And I have to believe the law enforcement has no legal obligation to protect me.

Their duty is to enforce the law and catch criminals per the Supreme Court case that happened out of Ohio. I want to say Akron. I don't remember the exact name. I would have to look it up, but because of that I would have to believe any law enforcement

professional whether they are New York State
Park rangers, DEC, if they are New York State
Police, local sheriff, local town, they would
go by this is what's written as the law, this
is, therefore, what we must enforce if someone
is violating it.

- Q. So at least as it relates to the Adirondack Park, the statement of political leaders on how the CCIA applies is not enough for you?
- A. Correct. Let me add --
- Q. No.

- 12 A. Okay. Sorry.
- Q. Actually, sorry. You should be able to add.

 Go ahead. I didn't mean to cut you off.
 - A. If I were to go ahead and go there and carry and a law enforcement professional were to observe me and stop me and question me and find that I was carrying, I don't believe that they would find it a sufficient defense or justification to say, well, the Governor or the Attorney General of New York or the head of the State Police has said this --
 - Q. Right.
 - A. -- you know, in a TV interview. Much like people I know now that are going through the

permitting process, the way the law is written it says everybody needs the new training requirement and other requirements. To have, again, politicians who are elected representatives and heads of various departments say, well, we only interpret that or we only mean it applies to downstate counties like Suffolk, Nassau, Westchester and the boroughs and New York City, again, I look at it and I tell people they can say what they want but what's actually written in the law, that's the standard you are held to and this is what it says currently.

- Q. Right. So in the case of Adirondack Park, right, you would not be comforted by the statements of political leaders or the leader of the State Police that Adirondack Park is not -- that we are not going to enforce the CCIA in Adirondack Park, right?
- A. Correct.

- Q. What kind of plans did you make to go to

 Adirondack Park in the period of time around

 Thanksgiving 2022? What firm plans did you

 make?
- A. I had firm plans, definitive plans. My plans

-BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 -Q. Because you wouldn't work Sunday? 1 2 A. Sunday, correct. Q. But either way you didn't make this trip 3 despite political leaders and the 4 5 representations that have been made in this case because that's not enough for you to be 6 7 assured that the CCIA wouldn't be enforced in Adirondack Park? 8 9 A. Correct. 10 MR. BELKA: Okay. Let's take a break. Five minutes. 11 12 13 (Recess was taken.) 14 15 BY MR. BELKA: 16 Q. One of the paragraphs in your declaration mentions that you would sometimes walk in 17 local parks. Do you recall that statement? 18 19 A. Yes. Q. I mean, I will read it to you. "Carry my 20 21 firearm for self-defense while walking in 22 local parks or when hiking on trails in 23 largely wooded and marshy areas a few times 24 each month." Do you recall that? 25 A. Yes.

-BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 -

- Q. Okay. Similar to failing to provide the dates on which you would have made your trip to the Adirondacks, you don't mention which local parks you would carry for in self-defense. Is that fair?
- A. Yes.

- Q. Okay. Can you tell me what local parks you are referring to in your declaration?
- A. Yes. The primary ones, but not all of them, are Stiglmeier Park in Cheektowaga because of being close to where I live, parts of the Clarence Bike Path which are actually two trails running from Amherst off of Transit Road into Clarence. If you remember the bike path rapist, that's where that stuff happened. The other one would be there's a Shoreline Trail running from the north side of Buffalo where Sheridan Drive approximately hits the 190 and it runs up through where -- or sorry, where Sheridan Drive hits the 290, sorry. And that runs from there up to -- or I am getting my roads confused. I am sorry.

The 190 goes around Buffalo. Where Sheridan Drive hits the 190 and it runs from there down to where the bridges going to Grand

- Island are and there's a park and ride directly underneath the bridges. You go past the old power plant in that section. It's called the Shoreline Trail, I believe.
- Q. What was the middle one that you mentioned?

 Parts of a trail path into Clarence, what's that one called?
- A. There's two trails. They are both -- in laymen's term people in the area just call them the Clarence Bike Path, but they are two bike and hiking paved trails that run through the woods of that area.
- Q. All right. I asked you to tell me what you meant by local parks in your declaration and you have identified Stiglmeier Park, the Clarence Bike Path, and the Shoreline Trail; is that correct?
- A. Yes.

- Q. All right. And understood that you qualified that to say primarily, were there any other local parks in your mind at the time you drafted your declaration, aside from Stiglmeier Park, the Clarence Bike Path and the Shoreline Trail?
- A. There are other parks I have been to. Those

-BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 -

being the primary most enjoyed. When I have gone to other parks, I have not kept a running list because I did not know I would need it in the future. So I cannot be certain of the exact name or like the date and time without speculating.

- Q. I mean, do you know the date and time on which you have been to Stiglmeier Park?
- A. Stiglmeier Park, the last time I went was the last Wednesday in August.
- Q. And what about before the last Wednesday in August, when was the last time you were at Stiglmeier Park?
- A. That would have been I went Sunday morning, the first Sunday in August.
- Q. And before that, when was the last time you were at Stiglmeier Park?
- A. Before that, would have been the end of July.
- Q. And is the end of July a specific date or time?
 - A. I would have to go back through my calendar.
 - Q. Right. My point is, I just want to know what you mean by local parks in your declaration.

 And you have identified Stiglmeier Park, you have identified the Clarence Bike Path and the

BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 -

- Shoreline Trail primarily. And then you note other parks, but that you haven't -- you might not know their names?
- A. Correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

- Q. Okay. But the reasoning you have for not providing their names is that you didn't know that you would be able to -- one second. Be required to come up with a date and time. I am just saying that that's consistent for the other parks as well?
- 11 A. Correct.
 - Q. Okay. So is it fair to read the words "local parks" in your declaration in paragraph 7 as Stiglmeier Park, the Clarence Bike Path, and the Shoreline Trail?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. You also note that there were hiking trails and largely wooded and marshy areas a few times each month?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. The hiking trails that you are referring to, are they different than

 Stiglmeier Park, the Clarence Bike Path, and the Shoreline Trail?
 - A. Those previously mentioned trails are some of

-BRETT CHRISTIAN - 11/16/2022 it, but there are some outside of Erie County 1 2 in the Southern Tier. Q. Okav. Aside from the ones that we have 3 4 already mentioned -- I am just trying to get 5 the world of local parks and hiking trails. Aside from the three that we have mentioned, 6 7 what else are you referring to? A. There's one other primary one. 8 That would be 9 the Harris Hill State Forest area down near 10 Gerry, New York. 11 Q. How do you spell Gerry? 12 A. G, as in George, E-R-R-Y. That's towards like 13 Chautauqua way. 14 Q. And when is the last time you were at the 15 hiking trails in Harris Hill? 16 A. Would have been the beginning of June around Father's Day weekend. 17 Q. And what gun were you carrying? 18 19 A. That would have been my Ruger SP101 and 357 Magnum. 20 21 Q. Both guns? 22

A. That's all one gun.

23

24

25

MR. BELKA: Oh, I deserve that. Can you read me back again what the gun was?

DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.